

PHILADELPHIA CITY PLANNING COMMISSION
November 18, 2008

PRESENT:

Andrew Altman, Chair
Camille Cates Barnett
Patrick J. Eiding
Anuj Gupta, representing Camille Cates Barnett
Natalia Olson de Savyckj
Nilda Ruiz
Joseph Syrnick
Peggy VanBelle, representing Rob Dubow

ABSENT:

Bernard Lee

Executive Director:
Deputy Executive Director:

Alan Greenberger
Gary J. Jastrzab

Chair Andrew Altman convened the City Planning Commission Meeting of November 18, 2008 at 1:18pm.

Mr. Altman welcomed everyone to the meeting. He explained how the meeting would proceed with regard to the American Commerce Center item. Since the City Planning Commission took public testimony about this item at its July 15, 2008 meeting, we are requesting that individuals who want to speak not repeat previous testimony, but rather present express thoughts and issues that have not been voiced before.

1) Executive Director's Update

Mr. Altman stated this is Alan Greenberger's first official meeting as Executive Director.

Mr. Greenberger stated this was his first meeting. He thanked Gary Jastrzab and the Philadelphia City Planning Commission staff. He thanked the Headmaster Rose Hagan and her staff for permitting the City Planning Commission to hold its meeting in the Friends Select School auditorium.

Mr. Greenberger had a few short announcements:

- a) He stated the Mayor's Budget Announcement will not affect our agency due to the attrition that happened to our staff prior to this announcement.
- b) The Mayor recommended that Eva Gladstein be retained as Executive Director of the Zoning Code Commission Executive Director. The ZCC intends to vote on hiring an Executive Director at its next meeting on December 10, 2009.
- c) Staff is putting together recommendations for a Design Review Committee that will be presented to the Commission next month. It is hoped that this Committee can be up and operating by February 2009.
- d) He spent 30 hours between Saturday and today in Boston, where he attended a conference sponsored by the Lincoln Land Institute. He will prepare a brief report to present to anyone on the Commission who might be interested.

2) *Information Only: Station Square Urban Design Concept (Bernard Cywinski/Bohlin Cywinski Jackson)*

Richard Redding, Director of Community Planning Division, introduced an urban design concept plan for "Station Square" on the 2900 block of Market Street, between two of the finest buildings in Philadelphia – 30th Street Station and the former U. S. Post Office at 30th Street. The purpose of the plan is to improve the public space between these two buildings. The Philadelphia City Planning Commission hired a consultant, Bohlin Cywinski Jackson, to develop some ideas for these improvements. Bernard Cywinski is here today to make the presentation.

Mr. Cywinski stated that Station Square is a gateway to both Center City and University City and to the railways running north and south. The plan is to make this area more pedestrian friendly and in scale with the buildings surrounding it. It is an important open space that should include an iconic sculpture on Market Street. He explained how people could use this open space as a gathering place, for outdoor seating and cafes, etc., with a tent structure for exhibits or food vendors. Mr. Cywinski then presented the specific components of the concept plan.

3) *Information Only: Boyd Theater Hotel*

Paula Brumbelow, planner for the Development Planning Division, stated this item is an upcoming Zoning Board Case that fronts on Chestnut, Sansom, 19th, and 20th Streets. In addition to the restoration of the former Boyd Theater, a new 28-story, 250 room boutique hotel is proposed.

Matt McClure, attorney with Ballard Spahr Andrews & Ingersoll, LLP, stated that this site was a great Center City movie house. The Historical Commission approved the application last Friday for exterior and interior historic preservation. The restored theater would available for be live entertainment, corporate events, etc.

Gary Martinez, of ARC Wheeler, provided background information on the history and architecture of the Boyd Theater. The site is a few blocks off of Rittenhouse Square. The theater ceiling has deteriorated from water leakage. The stage house of the theater will demolished, creating space for the hotel tower footprint. The theater and tower will be tied together. The first floor will be devoted to food and entertainment venues; between the first and fifth floors will be meeting space; the fifth floor will be the main reception area for the hotel. Concerns were expressed about the degree of curvature in the tower's exterior walls, changing the look of Sansom Street.

Ms. Olson asked about parking, and how many spaces will be provided.

Mr. McClure replied there will be dedicated parking provided at 2101 Chestnut Street. They did do a parking analysis.

Ms. Olson acknowledged the Historical Commission, and Councilman Bill Green, who worked to preserve the Boyd Theater.

Mr. Eiding replied that he had the opportunity to see the preservation of this theater. It is a real gem and he wants to make sure this doesn't go away.

Mr. McClure stated the next steps would be to come before the Philadelphia City Planning Commission on December 16 for a Commission recommendation, then go before the Zoning Board of Adjustment on December 17. They have a 2009 targeted timeline for construction.

4) *Regulations to Delegate Discretionary Authority to the Executive Director for Legislative Testimony and Other Actions in Accord with Previous Approvals or Policies*

Mr. Jastrzab stated these proposed regulations were distributed to Commission members at the October 10, 2008 meeting, and gave a brief summary. The regulations delegate authority to the Executive Director or his designee to make recommendations on legislation to City Council on behalf of the Commission. In addition, the Executive Director is authorized to approve minor changes to Institutional Development District plans and Preliminary Plats, approve Final Plats that contain no changes from approved Preliminary Plats, and review and make recommendations on Zoning Board of Adjustment cases. These are typically routine items in accord with previous policy. The City Planning Commission staff recommendation is approval.

Mr. Syrnick asked will actions delegated be reported back to the Commission.

Mr. Jastrzab replied that itemized lists of bills containing staff recommendations will be provided to the Commission on a regular basis.

Upon motion by Ms. Olson, seconded by Mr. Syrnick, the City Planning Commission approved the Regulations to Delegate Discretionary Authority to the Executive Director for Legislative Testimony and Other Actions in Accord with Previous Approvals or Policies.

- 5) Bill No. 080588 – American Commerce Center (1800 block of Arch Street) Zoning Remapping Ordinance and related amendments to the C-5 Commercial District classification of the Zoning Code and special height limits of the Benjamin Franklin Parkway Controls. (Introduced by Councilmember Clarke on June 19, 2008.)

William Kramer, Director of the Development Planning Division, stated that Bill No. 080588 is a zoning code amendment, and also a zoning remapping Bill. This Bill rezones the area between 18th, 19th, Arch, and Cuthbert Streets from “C-4” to “C-5” Commercial, Amends the zoning code to remove the Benjamin Franklin Parkway height restrictions for this site, and creates several zoning incentives and bonuses that would increase the total allowable FAR on this site from 24 to 27.5. Additional bonus FAR is awarded for an extension of the City’s public transit concourse and the inclusion of LEED-related environmental sustainability provisions. For this rezoning to take effect, a Plan of Development must be approved by the Philadelphia City Planning Commission, and there is a one-year sunset provision during which time the developers must show significant progress. There is a hearing before the Rules Committee on this Bill scheduled for December 3, 2008.

Peter Kelsen, attorney for the developer, stated that in July 2008 information about this development was presented to this Commission and to the community. The first step in the process is for the Philadelphia City Planning Commission’s recommendation, and then City Council legislation for rezoning. Then the developer will come back to the Philadelphia City Planning Commission with the plan of development. The plan presented today contains the Concourse plan extensions and LEED sustainability elements. The project includes a number of public benefits: public open spaces at grade and on upper floors; creation of both temporary construction and other permanent jobs and \$100 million of tax revenue to the City and School District. Mr. Kelsen noted that this can help to fund community facilities and libraries.

Gene Kohn of the Kohn Pederson Fox architectural firm gave a brief presentation about cities and growth. He said for cities to succeed, they need to change and grow. He talked about other cities and their tall buildings. He explained how William Penn laid out a grid plan with public squares. He gave a planning history of the area: the Benjamin Franklin Parkway Plan of 1892, construction started in 1917, and was completed in 1922. In the 1950s, the “Chinese Wall” came down to build Penn Center. There was an agreed upon limit in skyscraper height up until 1986, when Liberty Place was built, followed by the Mellon Bank Center. In 2008, the City’s largest building, the Comcast Center, was completed. At 1818 Arch Street, the American Commerce Center (ACC) is proposed where tall buildings already sitting over a major transportation center. The ACC would be the tallest building until the Freedom Tower is completed in New York.

Bill Louis, KPF architect, presented the major features of the proposed building. He then stated that the public benefits to be provided are: 1) active retail at street level; 2) public transit concourse extension; 3) 30% open space and public rooms at street level; 4) 6th floor will have garden and public exhibit space; 5) public restrooms; 6) enclosed, off-street loading; 7) parking spaces; 8) green roofs and other sustainability elements to attain LEED certification. There would be a health club on the 3rd floor. The concourse extension would be from 18th to 19th Streets.

Dr. Barnett left at 2:42pm. Anuj Gupta replaced her.

Mr. Kelsen noted that in July the Managing Director asked several questions regarding negative impacts on property values. There would be no negative impacts, and it would enhance hotel business.

Steve Mullin of Econsult stated the ACC would have a positive impact on property values and gave a report on other positive economic benefits.

In regard to Cuthbert Street, Mr. Kelsen noted he worked closely with PCPC and Streets Department staff on parking demand, traffic circulation, and pedestrian issues. The traffic study has been reviewed, augmented, and updated per staff requests. The study reports no major parking impacts. The hotel component of parking demand is estimated at less than 20% of total spaces provided. Loading and unloading along Cuthbert Street will not cause any traffic impediments. The delivery areas for FedEx and similar services will be in dedicated curbside locations on Arch Street. In terms of levels of pedestrian service, proposed sidewalk widths are the same as Liberty Place. Mr. Kelsen noted that 40% of the pedestrians accessing the Comcast Center building use its concourse connection.

Ed Panek, chairman of the Logan Square Neighborhood Association, stated that they facilitated meetings between the developer and the surrounding community. People have concerns, and they are waiting for a recommendation from his association. The Logan Square Neighborhood Association has remained neutral. LSNA's consultant, Kise Straw & Kolodner, will be completing their development plan shortly, and he would like to be able to put a recommendation into their plan.

Mr. Syrnick asked if the FedEx staging would be on the south side of Arch Street.

Mr. Kelsen replied yes.

Mr. Syrnick asked about the lay-by lane along 18th Street.

Mr. Kelsen replied it would be 6 ft. in width.

Mr. Syrnick asked about the parking for the proposed supermarket.

Mr. Kelsen replied that a minimum of 28 spaces would be provided for the supermarket.

Mr. Greenberger summarized by stating that staff met with the developer, Logan Square Neighborhood Association, and representatives from Kennedy House. The essential question staff has concerns density, namely changing the zoning from "C-4" to "C-5" and lifting the 125-foot height limit on this site. The staff supports the additional density and height, because this is a logical extension of what is already in the area.

The second change is to the "C-5" classification by adding new bonuses. Two of these incentives are not currently in the zoning code. Both are good bonuses that should probably be added to the Code at some point – providing additional FAR for an extension of the public transit concourse and for incentivizing environmental sustainability provisions – however, they require additional study.

The staff recommendation is to support the rezoning of this site from "C-4" to "C-5, but revisit the issue of additional of bonuses in the "C-5" classification so that all similarly zoned sites may benefit from these incentives. As a result, we recommend to City Council that the incentives paragraph of the bill should be stricken. A plan of development would still need to be approved by the City Planning Commission, and the new zoning would not become effective until that approval is granted. There is a Rules Committee hearing scheduled for this bill on December 3rd.

Mr. Synchron asked what the effect would be today if the Commission approves the staff recommendation.

Mr. Greenberger replied elimination of the height limit for this site and rezoning to "C-5." The developers must still have a plan of development approved by the Commission.

Ms. Olson replied that the City does not have a zoning classification for Transit Oriented Development.

Mr. Greenberger replied that effectively, the current code does have it for "C-5." The developers are proposing extra bonuses, over and above what the Code permits in "C-5."

Ms. Olson stated as we re-write our Zoning Code, additional incentives such as higher LEED certifications is something we really need to work on.

Ms. Ruiz asked about the extension of the Concourse.

Mr. Greenberger replied that such an incentive should be provided not just for this site, but for others as well.

Mr. Altman replied the plan of development has to come back to the Philadelphia City Planning Commission. We were asked to make a recommendation to the classification and bonuses. This is an important incentive to complete the plan of development.

Mr. Eiding asked if all of these comments will be proposed to City Council for their review.

Mr. Altman replied yes they will be recommended to City Council and opened the floor for public comment.

Joseph Beller, attorney representing Kennedy House residents, noted that the developers made a lovely presentation, but they should find another appropriate site. He stated that the development approvals were being rushed, and that the reason to develop should not be simply to have the tallest building.

Gray Smith, architect, urban planner, and consultant for the residents of the Kennedy House, stated he has reviewed the legislation and proposal. This project has evolved since he last saw it. He likes the public space provided, but the structure is still too big and bulky for the site. He cited several additional concerns: "C-4" and "C-5" zoning is for larger streets, while Arch and Cuthbert Streets are smaller streets; additional gross floor area ratio for this high-rise building puts burdens on sidewalks; exceeding the 125 ft. height limit and the need for studies for wind and light as a result; there should be 10 loading docks (a variance is needed if they provide only 6 loading docks); the noise coming from loading dock operations; parking study by Orth Rogers is incomplete (no discussion of parking demand for retail shoppers). He urged the Commission to disapprove this bill.

Mr. Altman thanked Mr. Smith for his testimony.

James McManaman, small business owner and 4-year resident stated his support for the proposal.

Douglas Renthal, resident of Old City, noted that there is not an iconic landmark that was not opposed when they were being built. He commends the architect and the developer, and supports the proposal.

Sara Maloney stated that she thinks this will impact positively on the City, and supports the project.

Chris Paliani, representative for LSNA and resident of 1835 Arch Street, stated urged Commission support for the project.

Josh Villwole, Center City Real Estate Agent, stated this is an appropriate site for a tall building and supports the proposal.

Bryan McHale stated that "tall is good" and supports the project.

Herbert Sharp, resident of Kennedy House, stated the traffic study does not true traffic conditions. If tandem buses running on Arch Street stop at a red light, they block the street. Traffic conditions are bad. He is opposed to the project.

Gabriel Gottlieb, resident of University City, stated he is in favor of this proposal. He thinks residents should not drive in this area and should use transit. He thinks it would be great if it had an observation deck.

Tony Ianuale, Senior Vice President of the Sterling, asked for information on the width of adjacent sidewalks.

Mr. Kelsen replied the sidewalk widths are 18 ft. on Arch Street.

Mr. Ianuale continued to state that the project will have a negative effect of the Sterling's light and air. While remaining neutral on the recommendation, additional study is needed regarding how building will be serviced.

Wally Zimolong, stated this project is transformative and supports the development.

Rob Stuart, resident and President of LSNA, stated that they have spent a lot of time on this issue, and appreciates the Philadelphia City Planning Commission spending a lot of time on it as well. There has been an extensive record of correspondence. LSNA views 19th Street as a line that large-scale development should not cross. They will continue their talks with the developer.

Ms. Olson asked how many times have LSNA and the developer met?

Mr. Kelsen replied since April to yesterday, they have met 9 times. Eight of the meetings they have exchanged 20 to 30 different documents. It has been fairly extensive.

Mr. Stuart, LSNA, stated that the LSNA has resources that other neighborhoods do not have. It is difficult to work with developers without professional resources.

Mr. Syrnick stated that we have heard about the traffic, parking spaces, loading docks, and the inadequate traffic study. How were the discussions with the Streets Department? Did they have concerns?

Dick Orth, of Orth Rodgers Associates, stated that he and Tom Chapman have had meetings with Darren Gatti and Charlie Denny of the Streets Department, as well as the Philadelphia City Planning Commission staff regarding the following: lay-by lane issues on 19th Street; truck maneuvering; and turning Cuthbert Street into a private street for building service. The Streets Department was satisfied with the traffic study.

Ms. Ruiz asked is the loading dock adequate.

Mr. Kelsen replied the Code requires 6 docks. The ACC development has 6 loading docks. We have talked with the Philadelphia City Planning Commission, License and Inspections, and the Streets Department on this issue. They are comfortable with this requirement.

Mr. Eiding stated that Mr. Greenberger did a great job presenting the staff recommendation. He expressed support for the staff recommendation.

Mr. Altman summarized that the Commission's concerns relate to: 1) "C-4" to "C-5" density and the structure of bonuses; 2) the Plan of Development to be considered by the Commission at a later date; 3) public benefits; and 4) public process.

He feels that Mr. Greenberger and the staff did a great job presenting that analysis. The "C-4" to "C-5" is a good recommendation. The additional bonuses for "C-5" should be separated, and should also be available to developers of other sites. The Plan of Development needs to come back to the Commission for final approval.

Upon motion by Ms. Olson, seconded by Mr. Eiding, the City Planning Commission approved the staff recommendation for Bill No. 080588.

- 6) Approval of the Minutes for October 21, 2008 (this item was inadvertently skipped in the agenda, so it is being considered at this point in the meeting.)

Upon motion by Mr. Eiding, the City Planning Commission approved the minutes of October 21, 2008.

- 7) Bill No. 080751 – Amending the Frankford Avenue Special District Controls (Introduced by Councilmember Krajewski on October 16, 2008)

Ms. Brumbelow stated this Bill is for all commercially-zoned properties with frontage on Frankford Avenue between Harbison Avenue and Solly Avenue, as well as all commercially-zoned properties with frontage on Cottman Avenue between Leon Street and Erdick Street.

The purpose of this Bill is to amend the existing prohibited uses in the District to include: barber and beauty shops; bars, pubs, and taverns; consignment shops; restaurants; retail sales of beauty products and/or wigs; and retail sales of telecommunications equipment as a main use, including but not limited to retail sales of cellular phones and pagers. This is in addition to continuing the prohibited use of employment agencies. This Bill has a first reading before the Rules Committee this Thursday 11/20/08.

The City Planning Commission staff recommendation is "disapproval." If this legislation becomes law, 87 of the businesses (25%) along this will become non-conforming uses, and staff fears that existing problems with retail vacancies along this commercial corridor will be compounded.

Mr. Eiding questioned the purpose of this Bill.

Mr. Greenberger replied this is a zoning overlay, and any businesses would have to negotiate with the local business association before any of the listed uses could locate along the corridor.

Upon motion by Mr. Eiding, seconded by Ms. Ruiz, the City Planning Commission disapproved Bill No. 080751.

- 8) Bill No. 080754 – Amending the zoning maps in an area bounded by "B" Street, Erie Avenue, "G" Street, and Tioga Street (Introduced by Councilmember Sanchez on October 16, 2008)

Ms. Brumbelow stated that the purpose of this Bill is to change the zoning designation on one parcel from "G2" Industrial to "L4" Industrial. The owner of this site is Tioga Self Storage. The owner proposes to continue the new storage facility, but would like to add commercial uses along "B" street. This property is bordered by residential row homes on both the south and west sides. By allowing commercial at this location, the neighborhood can be better served by having small retail stores closer to their neighborhoods. Additionally, the site was a former vacant parking garage that has now been renovated to provide a more appropriate use within the community.

This Bill was reported favorably out of Committee on November 17, 2008. A reclassification of this highly visible corner parcel from a "G2" Industrial designation to a "L4" Industrial designation will allow the industrial area to maintain its integrity, while allowing commercial uses which are permitted in the "L4" Industrial district. The owner's redevelopment of the property will contribute positively to the vitality of the "B" Street. The City Planning Commission staff recommendation is approval.

Upon motion by Mr. Eiding, seconded by Ms. Ruiz, the City Planning Commission approved Bill No. 080754.

- 9) Bill No. 080756 –Amending the zoning maps for an area bounded by Roberts Avenue, Wissahickon Avenue, Hunting Park Avenue, and Fox Street. (Introduced by Councilmember Jones on October 16, 2008)

Ms. Brumbelow stated the purpose of this Bill is to adjust a dimensional zoning boundary line by 20 feet between the "C3" Commercial and "G2" Industrial designations. This site is currently vacant land, which was last used by the TastyKake Baking Company. This Bill was reported out of Committee favorably with a minor amendment on November 17, 2008. The City Planning Commission staff recommendation is approval.

Upon motion by Ms. Ruiz, seconded by Mr. Eiding, the City Planning Commission approved Bill No. 080756.

- 10) Tacony Neighborhood Zoning Remapping:

- A) Bill No. 080789 – Amending the zoning maps for an area bounded by Ditman Street, Levick Street, Hegerman Street, Robbins Avenue, Keystone Street, Devereaux Street, Hegerman Street, Tulip Street, and Harbison Avenue.
- B) Bill No. 080790 – Amending the zoning maps for an area bounded by Ditman Street, Cottman Avenue, Keystone Street, and Hellerman Street

(Both Bills were introduced by Councilmember Krajewski on October 16, 2008)

Ms. Brumbelow stated these items are Tacony Neighborhood zoning remapping Bills. The area includes the Commercial District on Torresdale Avenue from Harbison Avenue to Cottman Avenue and along Longshore Street. The purpose of these Bills is to change the zoning designations in this area from "C1" Commercial to "C2" Commercial. The community wants to maintain a healthy commercial corridor, and prevent commercial properties from being converted to residential use as a matter of right. The City Planning Commission staff recommendation is approval.

Upon motion by Mr. Eiding, seconded by Ms. VanBelle, the City Planning Commission approved Bill Nos. 080789 and 080790.

- 11) Bill No. 080762 – Amending Section 14-1402 of the Philadelphia Code, entitled, “Parking in Residential Districts,” by imposing restrictions on off-street parking in front of residential buildings, under certain terms and conditions. (Introduced by Councilmembers Clarke, Tasco, and O’Neill on October 16, 2008.)

Martin Gregorski, Zoning Planner, stated the purpose of this Bill will prohibit open-air parking in the front yards of all one-family and duplex dwellings located in residentially zoned districts. This Bill attempts to address several problems that communities are experiencing. The first is that there are many property owners who are illegally converting their single-family dwellings to multi-family dwellings. The result is that there are not enough parking spaces in the neighborhood, so the owners are paving over front yards and allowing open-air parking where a lawn was located. Related to this is the lack of restrictions on paving over front yards. No permits are required for such actions, and this increases the amount of storm water runoff, which in turn taxes the City sewer infrastructure. The paving over of the front yards also contributes to the heat island effect. Finally, from an urban design perspective, parking in the front of houses is undesirable. Curb cuts from the street decrease street parking for everyone, and may cause dangerous conditions for pedestrians. Additionally, open-air parking in the front of residential properties does not help to build “community.” The City Planning Commission staff recommendation is approval.

Upon motion by Mr. Eiding, seconded by Ms. VanBelle, the City Planning Commission approved Bill No. 080762.

- 12) Bill No. 080837 – Amending Section 14-304 of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, entitled “C-3” Commercial District, by amending the floor area requirements for hotels, all under certain conditions. (Introduced by Councilmember DiCicco on October 30, 2008)

Mr. Gregorski stated this Bill will change the Floor Area Ratio (FAR) for hotels that are located in the “C-3” Commercial District from a permitted FAR of 450% of the area of the lot to a permitted FAR of 550% of the area of the lot. The Floor Area Ratio is determined by dividing the gross floor area of all buildings on the lot by the area of the lot. The net effect is that hotel developers will be able to build hotels with more density than what was previously permitted.

This Bill will, in effect, make hotels a commercial use in the “C-3” District, rather than a residential use. Additionally, while this Bill was written with new construction in mind, its passage would permit any existing hotel to move up to an FAR of 550%.

The City Planning Commission staff recommendation is approval with an amendment. Given that this Bill would retroactively permit additions on any existing hotel located within the “C-3” Commercial District, and that we have not had the chance to study the impacts of such a change, the staff recommends that we amend this Bill with the following changes:

Section 14-304(4)(a) should now read: “The gross floor area (as defined in 14-102(57)) of any building containing three or more families, *except for the construction of new hotels*, shall not exceed 450% of the area of the lot.

Section 14-304(4)(b) should now read: “The gross floor area (as defined in 14-102(57)) of any building containing less than three families *and the construction of new hotels*, shall not exceed 550% of the area of the lot.

Upon motion by Ms. Ruiz, seconded by Mr. Eiding, the City Planning Commission approved the staff’s recommendation with an amendment to Bill No. 080837.

- 13) Bill No. 080838 – Authorizing the Commissioner of Public Property, on behalf of the City of Philadelphia, to convey to the Philadelphia Authority for Industrial Development (PAID), for nominal consideration, a certain parcel of land with the building and improvements thereon, known as 1433-35 Poplar Street for further conveyance. (Introduced by Councilmember Clarke on October 30, 2008.)

William Erickson, planner for the Development Planning Division, stated the purpose of this Bill is to allow the City will transfer the property to PAID, who will in turn sell the property for market value (\$450,000) to Chan Investment, LLC. It is located in the Francisville section of the City. The existing building will be retained and rehabilitated into 16 two-bedroom apartments. The City Planning Commission staff recommendation is approval.

Upon motion by Mr. Eiding, seconded by Ms. VanBelle, the City Planning Commission approved Bill No. 080838.

- 14) Bill No. 080875 – Authorizing the Commissioner of Public Property, on behalf of the City of Philadelphia, to convey to the Philadelphia Authority for Industrial Development, the parcels of land owned by the City in Pike and Monroe Counties, Pennsylvania, that were formerly used by the City to operate Camp William Penn (formally known as Camp Happy), for further conveyance to the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, acting by and through the Department of Conservation and Natural Resources, for fair market value, under certain terms and conditions. (Introduced by Councilmember Quinones-Sanchez on November 13, 2008.)

Mr. Erickson stated the site is located approximately 80 miles outside Philadelphia at 4761 Marshalls Creek Road in East Stroudsburg, PA, in Pike and Monroe Counties. The site contains approximately 675 acres. The camp is situated on 120 of those acres; the remainder is mostly undevelopable woodland. Camp William Penn, formerly known as Camp Happy, was a summer camp for Philadelphia children, which was run through the Recreation Department. Due to aging infrastructure and declining enrollment, the camp was closed for the 2008 summer season. A deed restriction will be placed on the property that will allow it to be used only for conservation and/or recreation purposes. The sale price is \$1,000,000. Net proceeds from the sale will be deposited into the City's general fund. The City Planning Commission staff recommendation is approval.

Mr. Syrnick asked if the State will keep this site as open space.

Mr. Erickson replied that a deed restriction will limit its use to conservation and/or recreation purposes.

Upon motion by Mr. Syrnick, seconded by Ms. Ruiz, the City Planning Commission approved Bill No. 080875.

- 15) Preliminary Plat to subdivide a 3.25 acre tract of land, bounded by Aramingo Avenue, Church Street, Dungan Street, and Sepviva Street, to allow for the construction of 65 single-family attached dwellings with front shared driveways.

Sarah Chiu stated the location of this site is 2501 Church Street at the block bounded by Aramingo Avenue, Church Street, Sepviva Street, and Duncan Street for the Gateway Townhomes. It is currently zoned "G2" Industrial. The proposed zoning is for "R10A" Residential. A rezoning bill to rezone this property to R10A will be introduced by Councilmember DiCicco soon. Currently a vacant industrial use building remains on the site. Sepviva Street is on the City

Plan, but it is not opened. The site is located in the Aramingo Industrial district, a viable industrial area. It is surrounded by significant amount of active industrial uses, including Roadway Trucking, NE Building Products, Falcon Express, CTS Welding, Vista mailing and Printing, etc. Residential development at this location will negatively impact existing industrial uses adjacent to the site.

Recent real estate transaction records show there is continued industrial use related investment activities in this area. PennDOT's I-95/ BRI (Bridge Street to Betsy Ross Bridge) improvement plan will improve traffic flow for the estimated 180,000 motorists driving each day on I-95. The Commission has received two letters from business owners opposing this proposal. We do not feel this is appropriate use for this development. This is a viable industrial site for industrial development. PennDOT's long term plan consists of widening Aramingo Avenue and I-95 lanes. Aramingo Avenue and Church Street carry a high volume of traffic. There is also a development planning issue, we would encourage parking in the rear. The City Planning Commission staff recommendation is disapproval.

Mr. Eiding asked what would be the cost of a house.

Ms. Chiu replied \$200,000 to \$250,000.

Arsen Kashkashian, Esq., attorney for the owner and developer, stated this site is a vacant building and has not been used in over 15 years. It was a steel storage shelter. We have worked with Councilman DiCicco, and nearby residents are behind this subdivision. There is only 1 business there. The plan has been modified several times. The plan now has garages in the front with side view yards. There is only 1 entrance off of Aramingo Avenue. All of the industrial uses on the Sepviva Street side are not in use. Representative John Taylor has written a letter and has given his support to this plan. Councilman DiCicco supports it. Bridesburg wants this development. The only opposition is from the business owners, who want to keep the tractor trailers delivering to their businesses.

Mr. Altman asked why the Water Department disapproved this plan.

Mr. Eiding also wanted to know what will be done to gain approval.

Mr. Kashkashian replied that the Water Department requested a number of technical clarifications to the plan documents originally submitted and doesn't know specifically what the engineer will do to address them.

Mr. Altman then asked when revised plans will be submitted.

Mr. Kashkashian replied the plans should be resubmitted shortly.

Mr. Syrnick wanted to know how he plans to open Sepviva Street, when it is not legally opened.

Mr. Kashkashian replied that Councilman DiCicco said he will introduce legislation to open the street.

Mr. Greenberger told him that he needs to get the contradictions worked out between the sewer and streets issues.

Mr. Eiding commended anyone who could do this. All of these pieces need to come together.

Mr. Kashkashian replied that all of these pieces can come together.

Upon motion by Mr. Eiding, seconded by Mr. Syrnick, the City Planning Commission tabled the Preliminary Plat to subdivide a 3.25 acre tract of land, bounded by Aramingo Avenue, Church Street, Dungan Street, and Sepviva Street, to allow for the construction of 65 single-family attached dwellings with front shared driveways.

Items in Accord with Previous Policy:

- 16) Streets Bill No. 080757 – Authorizes a time extension for (Bill No. 060317) an ordinance to extend Parker Avenue from its current terminus approximately 66 ft. southwestward to the southwest side of said railroad right-of-way. (Introduced by Councilmember Jones on October 16, 2008.)

Mr. Erickson stated the purpose of this Bill is to extend the time limit on Bill No. 060317 to allow the developer to meet all of the conditions in the Bill. This development for the Umbria Village was presented to the Philadelphia City Planning Commission as a Zoning Board of Adjustment case 04-1597. The Philadelphia City Planning Commission recommended approval on March 10, 2005. Streets Bill No. 060317 was introduced by Councilmember Nutter and signed into law by Mayor Street on September 28, 2006. The City Planning Commission staff recommendation is approval.

Upon motion by Mr. Eiding, seconded by Ms. Ruiz, the City Planning Commission approved Streets Bill No. 080757.

- 17) Streets Bill No. 080794 – Authorizes a time extension for (Bill No. 030681) an ordinance to place on the City Plan a certain right-of-way for gas main purposes within the lines of former Morris Street from 30th Street to 31st Street. (Introduced by Councilmember Tasco for Council President Verna on October 23, 2008.)

Mr. Erickson stated the purpose of this Bill is to place a right-of-way for Gas Main purposes within the lines of former Morris Street from 30th Street to 31st Street. This proposal was part of the redevelopment of Tasker Homes. The Tasker Homes redevelopment was presented to the Philadelphia City Planning Commission on July 7, 2002 and the Final Plat was approved on September 4, 2002. The development has been built. The City Planning Commission staff recommendation is approval.

Upon motion by Mr. Eiding, seconded by Mr. Syrnick, the City Planning Commission approved Streets Bill No. 080794.

Mr. Altman adjourned the City Planning Commission Meeting of November 18, 2008 at 5:50 p.m.

SUMMARY

- 1) Executive Director's Update
- 2) *Information Only: Station Square Urban Design Concept (Bernard Cywinski/Bohlin Cywinski Jackson) (Introduction by Alan Greenberger)* Presentation
- 3) *Information Only: Boyd Theater Hotel (Paula Brumbelow)* Presentation
- 4) Regulations to Delegate Discretionary Authority to the Exec. Dir. for Legislative Testimony & Other Actions In Accord w/Previous Approvals or Policies Approved
- 5) Bill #080588 – American Commerce Center (1800 block of Arch St.) Zoning Remapping Ordinance & related Amendments to the “C-5” Commercial District classification of the Zoning Code & special height limits of Ben. Franklin Parkway Controls. (Introduced by Councilmember Clarke on 6-19-08) (William Kramer) Approved
PCPC staff's recommendation
- 6) Minutes of the Meeting of 10-21-08 Approved
- 7) Bill #080751 – Amending the Frankford Avenue Special District Controls (Introduced by Councilmember Krajewski On 10-16-08) (Paula Brumbelow) Disapproved
- 8) Bill #080754 – Amending the zoning maps In an area bounded by B St., Erie Ave., G St., & Tioga St. (Introduced by Councilmember Sanchez on 10-16-08) (Paula Brumbelow) Approved
- 9) Bill #080756 – Amending the zoning maps For an area bounded by Roberts Ave., Wissahickon Ave., Hunting Park Ave., & Fox St. (Introduced by Councilmember Jones on 10-16-08) (Paula Brumbelow) Approved
- 10) Tacony Neighborhood Zoning Remapping: Approved
 - A) Bill #080789 – Amending the zoning maps for an area bounded by Ditman St., Levick St., Hegerman St., Robbins Ave., Keystone St., Deveraux St., Hegerman St., Tulip St., & Harbison Ave.
 - B) Bill #080790 – Amending the zoning

maps for an area bounded by Ditman St., Cottman Ave., Keystone St., & Hellerman St. (Both Bills were introduced by Councilmember Krajewski on 10-16-08.) (Paula Brumbelow)

- 11) Bill #080762 –Amending Sect. 14-1402 of the Phila. Code, entitled, “Parking in Residential Districts”, by imposing restrictions on off-street parking in front of residential bldgs, under certain terms & conditions. (Introduced by Councilmembers Clarke, Tasco & O’Neill on 10-16-08.) (Martin Gregorski) Approved
- 12) Bill #080837 – Amending Sec. 14-304 of the Phila. Zoning Code, entitled, “C-3” Commercial district, by amending the floor area requirements for hotels, all under certain terms & conditions. (Introduced by Councilmember DiCicco on 10-30-08.) (Martin Gregorski) Approved w/staff’s recommended amendment.
- 13) Bill #080838 –Authorizing the Commissioner of Public Property, on behalf of the City of Phila., to transfer to PAID, for nominal consideration, a certain parcel of land w/the bldg & improvements thereon, known as 1433-35 Poplar St. for further conveyance. (Introduced by Councilmember Clarke on 10-30-08.) (William Erickson) Approved
- 14) Bill #080875 – Authorizing the Commissioner of Public Property, on behalf of the City of Phila., to convey to PAID, the parcels of land owned by the City in Pike & Monroe Counties, PA that were formerly used by the City to Operate Camp Wm Penn (formally known as Camp Happy) for further conveyance to the Commonwealth of PA, acting by & Through the Dept. of Conservation & Natural Resources, for fair market value, under certain terms & conditions. (Introduced by Councilmember Quinones- Sanchez on 11-13-08.) (William Erickson) Approved
- 15) Preliminary Plat to subdivide a 3.25 acre Track of land, bounded by Aramingo Ave., Church St., Dungan St., & Sepviva St., to allow for the construction of 65 single-family attached dwellings w/front shared driveways. (Sarah Chiu) Tabled

Items in Accord with Previous Policy:

- 16) Streets Bill #080757 – Authorizes a time extension for (Bill #060317) an ordinance to extend Parker Ave. from its current terminus approx. 66 ft. southwestward to the southwest side of said railroad right-of-way. (Introduced by Councilmember Jones on 10-16-08.) (William Erickson) Approved
- 17) Streets Bill #080794 – Authorizes a time extension for (Bill #030681) an ordinance to place on the City Plan a certain right-of-way for gas main purposes within the lines of former Morris St. from 30th St. to 31st St. (Introduced by Councilmember Tasco for Council President Verna on 10-23-08.) (William Erickson) Approved